

**Appendix I:  
Description of  
32 Direct Physician  
Surveys of Defensive Medicine  
Reviewed by OTA**

Appendix I—Description of 31 Direct Physician Surveys of Defensive Medicine Reviewed by OTA

Author, year of release	Survey year	Sample population location	Specialty	Survey characteristics	Response rate (percent)
Porter, Novelli & Associates, 1983a	1983	National	Obstetrician/ Gynecologists (Ob\Gyn)	Survey of random sample of American College of Obstetricians and Gynecologists (ACOG) members regarding medical liability Insurance premiums, claims experience, and practice changes in response to malpractice risks	50.1%
Reynolds et al 1987 <sup>a</sup>	1983/1 984	National	All	Data from the 3rd quarter 1983 and 4th quarter 1984 American Medical Association (AMA) Socioeconomic Monitoring Surveys on practice changes made in response to liability risk	63.0
Bligh, American College of Surgeons, 1984C	1984	National	Surgeons	Survey of members regarding medical liability Insurance premiums, claims experience, and practice changes in response to medical liability	36
Kansas Medical Society, 1985 <sup>d</sup>	1984	Kansas	All	Survey of all members for data and opinions on the medical professional liability environment	50
Needham, Porter, Novelli, 1985 <sup>b</sup>	1985	National	Ob\Gyn	Survey of random sample of ACOG members regarding medical liability Insurance premiums, malpractice claims experience, and practice changes in response to malpractice risks	39.7
Texas Medical Association, 1985f	1985	Texas	All	Survey regarding professional liability and defensive medicine	23.2
Charles, Wilbert, & Frankel 1985g	1985	Chicago	All	Survey of physicians to assess the personal and professional impact of malpractice litigation	36.6
Alabama Academy of Family Physicians 1986 <sup>b</sup>	1985	Alabama	Family and General Practitioners (F\GP)	Survey of all members regarding obstetric practice	84
Iowa Family Physician Survey 1985	1985	Iowa	F\GP	Survey on medical liability	47
Michigan State Medical Society, 19851	1985	Michigan	Ob\Gyn	Survey to measure the potential impact of the professional liability Insurance problem	56
University of Nevada, School of Medicine, 1985 <sup>k</sup>	1985	Nevada	Ob\Gyn and F\GP	Phone survey of rural doctors regarding obstetrical care and malpractice concerns	62

(continued)

Appendix I—Description of 31 Direct Physician Surveys of Defensive Medicine Reviewed by OTA (cont'd).

Author, year of release	Survey year	Sample population location	Specialty	Survey characteristics	Response rate (percent)
The Oregon Medical Association 1986 <sup>l</sup>	1985	Oregon	Ob\Gyn and F\GP	Survey to assess the impact of professional liability issues on access to obstetrical care	81.1
Rosenblatt and Wright, 1987 <sup>m</sup>	1985	Washington	F\GP	Survey to assess the impact of rising malpractice insurance premiums on the practice of obstetrics	80.3
Rosenbach and Stone, 1990 <sup>n</sup>	1986	National	All	Interview survey regarding costs and availability of malpractice insurance and their impact on physician practice	74.2
American Academy of Family Physicians, 1987 <sup>o</sup>	1986	National	F\GP	Survey to assess impact of cost and availability of liability insurance on the practice of obstetrics	33.7
Opinion Analysts, Inc., 1986 <sup>p</sup>	1986	Texas	All	Survey to measure the impact of professional liability insurance rates on the medical profession	35.5
Georgia Obstetrical and Gynecological Society, 1987 <sup>q</sup>	1986	Georgia	Ob\Gyn	Survey of how malpractice liability affects obstetric care	6.1
Kentucky Medical Association, 1987 <sup>r</sup>	1986	Kentucky	Ob\Gyn and F\GP	Survey regarding professional liability	4.2
Michigan Academy of Family Physicians, 1989 (Smith et al., 1989) <sup>s</sup>	1986	Michigan	F\GP	Survey to describe the characteristics of family physicians who practice obstetrics and identify factors prompting them to discontinue practice	81.5
Rosenblatt and Detering, 1988 <sup>t</sup>	1986	Washington	Ob\Gyn, F\GP, and midwives	Survey to describe the impact of rapidly rising malpractice premiums on obstetric practice and to assess the impact of tort reform on professional liability costs	63.5
Opinion Research Corp., 1988 <sup>u</sup>	1987	National	Ob\Gyn	Survey of random sample of ACOG members regarding medical liability insurance premiums, claims experience and practice changes in response to malpractice risks	48.4
Shapiro et al., 1989 <sup>v</sup>	1987	Wisconsin	All	Survey to assess the impact of malpractice litigation on the doctor-patient relationship and to collect data that might suggest effective tort reform	42.7
Illinois Department of Public Health, 1987 (Ring, 1987) <sup>w</sup>	1987	Illinois	Ob\Gyn and F\GP	Survey on changes in availability of obstetrical services	25.6
Weisman et al., 1989 <sup>x</sup>	1987	Maryland	Ob\Gyn F\GP and Internal Medicine	Telephone survey regarding practice changes as a result of the current malpractice liability climate	6.5

(continued)

Appendix I—Description of 31 Direct Physician Surveys of Defensive Medicine Reviewed by OTA (cont'd).

Author, year of release	Survey year	Sample population location	Specialty	Survey characteristics	Response rate (percent)
Texas Medical Association, 1988Y	1988	Texas	All	Survey to assess impact of malpractice Insurance premiums cost and liability risk on physician practice	41
Louisiana Section of ACOG, 1988Z	1988	Louisiana	Ob\Gyn	Survey on professional liability	384
Lawthers et al , 1992aa	1989	New York	All	Survey of physicians' perceptions of the risk of being sued and their impact on physician practice	405
Opinion Research Corp 1990 <sup>bb</sup>	1990	National	Ob\Gyn	Survey of random sample of ACOG members regarding medical liability Insurance premiums, claims experience, and practice changes in response to malpractice risks	540
Opinion Research Corp ,1992 <sup>cc</sup>	1992	National	Ob\Gyn	Survey of random sample of ACOG members regarding medical liability insurance premiums, claims experience, and practice changes in response to malpractice risks	51
Minnesota Ob\Gyn Survey (Meader, no date)dd	no date	Minnesota	Ob\Gyn	General survey regarding income and malpractice Insurance cost concerns	Not provided
West Virginia State Medical Association, no date <sup>ee</sup>	no date	West Virginia	All	Survey regarding professional liability Insurance problems facing physicians	50

<sup>a</sup>Porter, Novelli & Associates, "Professional Liability Insurance and Its Effects Report of a Survey of ACOG's Membership," prepared for the American College of Obstetricians and Gynecologists, Washington, DC, August 31, 1983

<sup>b</sup>RA Reynolds, JA Rizzo, and ML Gonzalez, "The Cost of Medical Professional Liability," *Journal of the American Medical Association* 257(20) 2776-2781, May 22/29, 1987

<sup>c</sup>T J Bligh, "American College of Surgeons Professional Liability Survey Report, 1984," Executive Services Department for the Regents' Ad Hoc Committee on Professional Liability, American College of Surgeons, Washington, DC, 1984

<sup>d</sup>Kansas Medical Society, "Professional Liability Survey," *Kansas Medicine* P 43, February 1985

<sup>e</sup>Needham, Porter, Novelli, "Professional Liability Insurance and Its Effect Report of a Survey of ACOG's Membership," prepared for the American College of Obstetricians and Gynecologists, Washington, DC, November 1985

<sup>f</sup>Texas Medical Association, "Texas Medical Association's 1985 Professional Liability Survey" (unpublished), Austin, TX September 1985

<sup>g</sup>S C Charles, J R Wilbert and K J Franke, "Sued and Nonsued Physicians' Self- Reported Reactions to Malpractice Litigation," *American Journal of Psychiatry* 142(2) 437-440, April 1985

<sup>h</sup>Alabama Academy of Family Physicians, "A Survey of Family Physicians Providing Obstetrical Care A Preliminary Report," Alabama Academy of Family Physicians, Montgomery, AL, February, 1986

<sup>i</sup>Iowa Medical Society, "Iowa Family Physician Survey Findings" (unpublished), 1987

<sup>j</sup>M Block, "Professional Liability Insurance and Obstetrical Practice," commissioned by Michigan State Medical Society, July 1985

<sup>k</sup>HECROW University of Nevada School of Medicine, Off Ice of Rural Health, Survey of Rural Doctors Regarding Their Participation (Or not) in Obstetrics, "Off Ice of Rural Health, University of Nevada School of Medicine, Mar 11, 1985

<sup>l</sup>The Oregon Medical Association, Ad Hoc 06 Task Force on Professional Liability, "The Impact of Professional Liability Issues on Access to Obstetrical Care in Oregon," Oregon Medical Association, March 1986

<sup>m</sup>R A Rosenblatt and C L Wright, "Rising Malpractice Premiums and Obstetric Practice Patterns The Impact on Family Physicians in Washington State," *The Western Journal of Medicine* 146(2) 246-248, February 1987

<sup>n</sup>M L Rosenbach and A G Stone "Malpractice Insurance Costs and Physician Practice, 1983 -1986," *Health Affairs* 9(4) 176-185, 1990

(continued)

## Appendix I—Description of 47 Direct Physician Surveys of Defensive Medicine Reviewed by OTA (cont'd).

- <sup>a</sup>American Academy of Family Physicians Committee on Professional Liability and Division of Research and Information Services Family Physicians and Obstetrics A Professional Liability Study 1987
- p Opinion Analysts Inc The Texas Medical Association Professional Liability Insurance Survey prepared for the Texas Medical Association September 1986
- q Georgia Obstetrical and Gynecological Society GOGS 1987 Survey Results Atlanta GA 1987
- r G S Bonham Survey of Kentucky Obstetric Practice *Journal of the Kentucky Medical Association* 349 353, June 1987
- s M A Smith L A Green and T L Schwenk "Family Practice Obstetrics in Michigan Factors Affecting Physician Participation on *The Journal of Family Practice* 28(4) 433 437 1989
- t R A Rosenblatt and B Detering "Changing Patterns of Obstetric Practice in Washington State The Impact of Tort Reform *Family Medicine* 20(2) 101 107, March/April 1988
- u Opinion Research Corp , "Professional Liability and Its Effects Report of a 1987 Survey of ACOG's Membership prepared for the American College of Obstetricians and Gynecologists Washington, DC March 1988
- v R S Shapiro, D E Simpson, S L Lawrence et al "A Survey of Sued and Nonsued Physicians and Suing Patients " *Archives of Internal Medicine* 149:2190 2196 October 1989
- w M C Ring, ' Draft Report Changes in Availability of Obstetrical Services in Illinois" Division of Local Health Administration, Illinois Department of Public Health 1987
- <sup>x</sup>C S Weisman, L L Morlock, M A Teitelbaum et al , Practice Changes in Response to the Malpractice Litigation Climate *Medical Care* 27(1) 16 24 January 1989
- Y Texas Medical Association, ' Texas Medical Association 1988 Professional Liability Survey" summer 1988
- <sup>z</sup>W P Begnaud, "Obstetric and Gynecologic Malpractice in Louisiana Incidence and Impact " prepared for the Louisiana Section of the American College of Obstetrics and Gynecology, Lafayette, IA 1988
- aaA.G. Lawthers, A R Localio and N M Laird, Physicians Perceptions of the Risk of Being Sued " *Journal of Health Politics, Policy and Law* 17 ( 3 ) 463-482, 1992
- bbOpinion Research Corporation, "Professional Liability and Its Effects: Report of a 1990 Survey Of *ACOG's* Membership, " prepared for the American College of Obstetricians and Gynecologists, Washington, DC, September 1990
- ccOpinion Research Corporation, "Professional Liability and Its Effects Report of a 1992 Survey of ACOG's Membership, " prepared for the American College of Obstetricians and Gynecologists, Washington DC, October 1992
- ddE.C. Meader, Jr., , Minnesota Obstetrics and *Gynecology Practice Survey Summary*, prepared for the Minnesota Section of the American College Of Obstetrics and Gynecology, no date
- eeWest Virginia State Medical Association, "West Virginia State Medical Association's Physician Survey" (unpublished), undated

SOURCE Off Ice of Technology Assessment, 1994